Pointing Towards Improved PDC Bit Performance: Innovative Conical Shaped Polycrystalline Diamond Element Achieves Higher ROP and Total Footage

Michael Azar, Allen White, Robert Ford, Smith Bits, a Schlumberger Company

Abstract

Vibration induced impact damage/cutter chipping caused by inefficient shearing action at the center of a PDC bit can significantly reduce ROP and overall drilling efficiency in a wide range of formations. To solve the problem, a R&D initiative was launched to investigate new cutter designs and experiment with their count/placement to improve drilling efficiency and mitigate vibration. The research yielded an innovative conical shaped polycrystalline diamond element (CDE) with an ultra-thick synthetic diamond layer.

The conical element has undergone extensive laboratory testing to evaluate its potential to improve PDC bit performance. Using a single cutter test apparatus, engineers measured the element’s ability to fracture rock at varying depths-of-cut. They determined the CDE exhibits up to a 70% increase in cutting efficiency compared to standard PDC cutters.

Next, an existing PDC bit was modified to include the new conical diamond element at bit center. The CDE was positioned at bit center with the conical tip pointing vertically down towards the rock. The location of the conical element combined with the optimized placement of the conventional PDC cutters allows an unconfined rock column to develop. The stress relieved column is then continuously crushed by the centrally positioned conical element. This solves the fundamental center cutting structure issues enabling the bit to deliver faster penetration rates and reduce the potential for vibration.

A base Mi616 type bit was fitted with a CDE and run in North Dakota and Utah through a highly mixed sequence of formations where the primary objective was to increase ROP and to reach kick-off point (KOP) in one run. The CDE equipped PDC bit improved ROP over a longer interval drilled compared to benchmark PDCs used in offsets. Subsequent field testing has substantiated the CDE’s potential and how it can be used to deliver improved PDC bit performance.

Introduction

In recent years, PDC bits have made significant progress encroaching on traditional rollercone applications because of their ability to drill longer intervals at higher penetration rates. The gains were initially driven by modeling of cutter loading and by analyzing drilling mechanics to quantify and mitigate downhole vibrations.\(^1\,^2\)

As operators continued to explore the outer boundaries of the PDC application envelope, engineers began to describe the damaging effects that different types of vibrations have on PDC bits and cutters. R&D analysis successfully categorized the four main downhole vibration types (axial, lateral, torsional, whirl) and bit manufacturers began to produce specific technologies to stabilize the bit body and preserve the cutting structure in different formations.\(^3\,^8\)

Additional research and manufacturing initiatives have produced superior cutter technology that can withstand harder and more abrasive formations.\(^9\,^17\) In 2004, fixed cutter bits were crowned king with the total worldwide footage drilled by PDC (54%) surpassing that of rollercone (46%). However, efficiently drilling with PDC in very hard, interbedded and highly abrasive formations remains challenging.

Conical Diamond Element

It is essential for the industry to create a differentiating drilling action to increase penetration rates and extend PDC bit life in abrasive and interbedded formations to further reduce drilling costs. To develop a combination shearing/crushing fixed cutter bit, a focused research initiative was launched to investigate new design elements and experiment with their count and placement to improve drilling performance. The project was successful and yielded an innovative new Stinger\(^18\) conical shaped polycrystalline diamond element (CDE) with a thick synthetic diamond layer (Figure 1).

The element’s innovative geometric design delivers high point loading for effective formation fracture. The conical element is constructed with advanced synthetic diamond manufacturing systems specifically designed to generate higher pressures and
temperatures during the sintering process while increasing micro-cell size for improved diamond quality.

**Advanced Materials Science**

The CDE is fundamentally superior to traditional PDC cutters and diamond enhanced inserts (DEI) used in PDC and rollercone bits respectively. The element is manufactured using proprietary equipment and processes that are capable of producing extreme pressures and temperatures to form a substantial layer of polycrystalline diamond (PCD) on a conical geometry. The PCD layer on the CDE is approximately twice as thick as the diamond layer on a conventional PDC cutter. Compared to conventional PDC cutters the conical element exhibits 25% more wear resistance and almost double the impact strength (Figure 2). Combined with the unique conical geometry, the thick diamond structure creates an extremely robust and durable cutting element.

**Single Element Testing**

The CDE has undergone extensive testing to evaluate its potential to improve penetration rates and increase total footage capabilities. In a single-cutter test apparatus, the CDE exhibited significant increases in resistance to impact damage and abrasive wear compared to conventional PDC cutters. Laboratory tests using CDEs on a vertical turret lathe (VTL) confirmed the following:

- At 0.02-in depth of cut with 1200lbs threshold, the CDE displayed a 70% increase in cutting efficiency compared to the baseline PDC cutter
- At 0.05-in depth of cut with 1200lbs threshold, the CDE cutter showed a 35% increase in cutting efficiency compared to the baseline PDC cutter
- The CDE has significantly improved abrasion resistance over extended wet testing on a VTL

**PDC Performance Limiter**

With laboratory testing of single CDEs complete, the next challenge was to determine how to incorporate the element into a PDC cutting structure. The study focused on a conventional PDC bit’s problematic center cutting structure, or cone area, which presents several distinct design challenges:

1. The physical space limitation creates an inherent problem because designers cannot simply position multiple cutters in this location.
2. The cutters at the bit center typically experience the lowest rotational velocity.
3. To produce an effective cutter layout that addresses the application requirements in terms of ROP, bit durability, stability and steerability the center most cutters are subjected to the highest axial load.

4. The cone area cutters are required to remove a relatively small volume of formation. This is an inefficient use of available energy to remove rock.

Combined, these fundamental issues create an inherently inefficient shearing mechanism at the center of all conventional PDC bits (Figure 3). This limitation is most evident when changing operating parameters (WOB/RPM) and drilling through transition zones with different lithologies and a high degree of UCS variance. As the center cutters engage formation their depth-of-cut can vary considerably impacting overall behavior of the entire cutting structure. The resulting torque fluctuations alter dynamic response exposing the bit to damaging lateral/torsional shock and vibration. The dysfunction reduces ROP and can cause cutting structure damage terminating the bit run resulting in multiple trips to complete the hole section. In harder formations, the intrinsic weakness of the center cutting structure design causes accelerated wear leading to a cored dull condition rendering the bit damaged beyond repair.

**Design Process**

To fully exploit the CDE’s innovative design advantages, engineers used an FEA-based drill bit design platform to selectively abbreviate the blades that held the bit’s low-velocity center cutters. The void space would allow a stress-relieved rock column to develop at the bit’s center. Designers then strategically positioned the conical element in the newly created cavity to continuously crush and fracture the unconfined rock column (Figure 4). In addition, the abbreviated design contains fewer standard PDC cutters creating less division of weight-on-bit which increases cutter loading improving overall drilling efficiency.

Additional modeling tools were employed to further enhance performance of the new bit design. Using finite element analysis software, engineers then investigated the stress field at the precise point where the Stinger element indents the formation.

The study revealed high stress conditions at the contact point, which can increase fracture generation within the rock, can be achieved with significantly less applied force compared to standard PDC cutters. Bits equipped with a centrally located Stinger element have also displayed an increase in dynamic stability with less potential for vibration.

With the central placement of the CDE completed, the next step was to modify nozzle orientation to efficiently clean and cool the new style cutting structure. Using advanced computational fluid dynamics software, a hydraulic analysis was performed and nozzle positions were adjusted to enhance cuttings removal and cleaning of the conical element and adjacent borehole.
Confirming Modifications
Using the dynamic modeling system created a time-based 3-D image that clearly illustrated the principle of rock column formation (Figure 5). As the rock column forms, it becomes less confined and fractures with significantly less energy than a typically confined formation. The study also enabled engineers to incorporate a high degree of stability into each design and to quantitatively analyze the results of iterative design changes.20,32

The result was optimized rock removal feature that produced a new-style PDC bit with a combination shearing/crushing rock failure mechanism. Virtual testing of the new PDC bit design swiftly advanced the engineering concept and confirmed the bit would improve ROP, eliminating costly and time-consuming field trials. As a result, the operator quickly benefits from improved bit performance while minimizing risk associated with an untested design. The next step was to test a full-scale CDE-equipped PDC bit in a pressurized drilling simulator to validate the results of the 4-D modeling study. The bit was manufactured in Houston and shipped to the company’s test facility in Utah for further assessment. As expected, the previous conclusions were confirmed and the CDE-equipped PDC bit created a stress relieved rock column at the center of the hole which was crushed by the CDE (Figure 6).

Additional testing revealed a CDE equipped PDC bit also generates much larger drill cuttings than standard PDC bits thereby enabling rock characterization at the surface by geologists or mud logging personnel (Figure 7). This added benefit makes the CDE PDC bit ideal for high-profile exploratory wells through a reservoir section or when determining exact wellbore position in the stratigraphic column is critical.

Hole Quality
Next, a next full-scale test bit was shipped to the service company’s Cambridge research center to analyze the affect that a centrally placed CDE would have on bit behavior and hole quality. The test was run in hard-medium grained Lazonby sandstone with a UCS of 9,000psi. The experiment would determine how changes in WOB would influence borehole quality. Bit revolution would remain constant at 85RPM to control variance.

After the hole was drilled a laser scanning device was inserted into the hole to accurately measure variations in hole diameter. The results strongly indicate that standard PDC bits have a greater tendency to produce an out-of-gauge diameter than a bit equipped with the centrally placed CDE (Figure 8). The CDE-equipped bit displayed more consistent hole diameter/quality with less energy expended on unproductive movement.

Novel PDC Design
The encouraging results of the modeling effort and laboratory testing convinced engineers that a single CDE positioned at bit center would improve ROP performance and enhance dynamic stability. An 8¾-in MDSi616 base design was selected for field testing and the conical element was positioned at the bit’s central axis (Figure 9). The CDE’s innovative material properties enable it to be run in a wide variety of formation types and BHA configurations.

Field Test 1
An 8¾-in MDSi616 with a centrally placed CDE was field tested in the North Dakota portion of the Williston Basin. The bit was run on a steerable motor BHA in three similar vertical hole applications through a highly mixed and interbedded sequence of formations including sand/shale, salt and limestone/dolomite/anhydrite with UCS range between 2-25kpsi.

The main objectives were to improve ROP and reach kick-off point (KOP) in one run. The ROP on all three CDE runs was better than the best offset (131 ft/hr) and 56% better than the 11 well offset average (Figure 10). On the last run the CDE bit set a new field record delivering the fastest 8¾-in vertical drill-out to KOP in Divide County of 197.1 ft/hr. The record setting bit came out of the hole in good condition with no wear on the CDE and was dull graded 1-2-CT-S-X-IN-WT-KOP (Figure 11).

In another Williston Basin application a single 6-in MDSiZ613 with CDE drilled the entire lateral section of 9544 ft at 97 ft/hr in one run, a 49% improvement in ROP compared to three bit runs required on an offset well. The bit “locked in” and displayed excellent directional control staying within the narrow target reservoir window. The run set operator records for highest 24-hour footage (2903 ft/day) and fastest lateral TD to date (Figure 12).

Field Test 2 (Duchesne County, Utah)
The next test was conducted in northern Utah with a 7 7/8-in Mi616 in a directional application on a steerable motor BHA with a 1.5° bend angle. The objective was to evaluate if the CDE equipped PDC bit could increase ROP, reduce vibration and reach section TD in one run.

The lithology of the application consists of difficult interbedded sand/shale/limestone with UCS varying between 2-30kpsi. Additional difficulty is encountered in the Wasatch formation (5900-10,500TVD) where 10-15kpsi sandstone is interbedded with soft shale (2-5kpsi) and hard sandstone stringers that peak at 25-30kpsi.

The steerable motor BHA went in at 277ft and drilled 6050ft of 7 7/8-in wellbore to TD the hole section at 6327ft in 43 IADC hours. The field test was successful and outperformed all four offset ROPs, drilling 4.4% faster than the best offset and reached section TD in one run (Figure 13).
out of the hole with a much better dull condition compared to the four offsets and was dull graded 1-2-BT-C-X-IN-WT-TD (Figure 14). The CDE was in excellent condition with no noticeable wear.

Conclusions
Field tests in North Dakota and Utah USA strongly indicate that PDC bits equipped with CDE to form a centralized core then crush it are improving ROP in vertical, curve and lateral applications drilling through difficult interbedded formations with a high range of UCS values.

The thick synthetic diamond reduces wear especially in the cone area resulting in longer runs minimizing the cost of bit replacement trips. The conical element also forces the bit to rotate around its central axis enhancing dynamic stability while decreasing vibration.

The new style bit has the potential to increase performance in a wide range of formation types and applications in various worldwide applications. The conical element can be added to various designs with minor modifications then tailored for a specific application.

Acknowledgements
The authors would like to thank management at Smith Bits, a Schlumberger Company for permission to publish the laboratory and field performance data. Also thanks to engineering and R&D personnel at Novatek for supporting the bit development program. Finally, thanks to Craig Fleming, Smith Bits for his technical writing and editorial contributions.

References
Pointing Towards Improved PDC Bit Performance: Innovative Conical Shaped Polycrystalline Diamond Element Achieves Higher ROP and Total Footage

Lake City, Utah June 27-30, 2010.


Figure 1 – Unique conical geometry with thick layer of synthetic diamond enhances drilling efficiency and ROP.

Figure 2 – The conical element possesses superior wear/impact resistance compared to PDC cutters and DEI for rollercone.
Pointing Towards Improved PDC Bit Performance: Innovative Conical Shaped Polycrystalline Diamond Element Achieves Higher ROP and Total Footage

Figure 3 – Conventional PDC bit design has difficulty with rock destruction at borehole center

Figure 4 – Conical element's center position delivers unique crushing action delivering high point loading
**Figure 5** – Modeling system used to simulate dynamic bit behavior confirmed ROP improvement in different lithologies

**Figure 6** - Full scale drilling simulator validated FEA-model with conventional PDC bit (l) and new CDE equipped bit (r)
**Figure 7** - Large cuttings produce by CDE equipped PDC bit (right) greatly enhances geological/petrological evaluation

**Figure 8** – Laboratory testing confirmed bit with CDE demonstrates more stable drilling behavior for improved borehole quality
**Figure 9** - An 8¾-in MDSi616 fitted with CDE technology to increase drilling efficiency/ROP

**Figure 10** – ROPs of three MDSi616 CDE runs is faster than the best offset drilled with conventional PDC bit
Figure 11 – Record setting MDSi616 in excellent dull condition after drilling 6209ft of formation in 31.5 hrs

Figure 12 – Record performance with CDE in Bakken lateral; Head-to-head comparison with same operator and rig.
Figure 13 – ROP of 7 7/8-in Mi616 test run with CDE drilled faster than best four offsets.

Figure 14 – New style 7 7/8-in Mi616 in good dull condition with the CDE’s pointed tip fully intact.